Baanes the Notary on 'Old Edessa'

George Huxley

I N HIS *Epitoma* of the *Historiae Philippicae* of Pompeius Trogus, Justin gives an account of the founding of Aigeai in Macedonia by Karanos:

> *sed et Caranus cum magna multitudine Graecorum sedes in Macedonia responso oraculi iussus quaerere, cum Emathiam venisset, urbem Edessam non sentientibus oppidanis propter imbrium et nebulae magnitudinem gregem caprarum imbrem fugientium secutus occupavit; revocatusque in memoriam oraculi, quo iussus erat ducibus capris imperium quaerere, regni sedem statuit; religioseque postea observavit, quocumque agmen moveret, ante signa easdem capras habere, coeptorum duces habiturus, quas regni habuerat auctores. urbem Edessam ob memoriam muneris Aegaeas, populum Aegeadas [Argeadas Abel, Ruehl] vocavit. pulso deinde Mida (nam is quoque portionem Macedoniae tenuit) aliisque regibus pulsis in locum omnium solus successit primusque adunatis gentibus variorum populorum veluti unum corpus Macedoniae fecit, crescentique regno valida incrementorum fundamenta constituit.*[1]

Professor N. G. L. Hammond has commented upon the passage in connexion with the Macedonian foundation oracles and with the distinction between Edessa (Vodena, Βοδενά) and Aigeai: "Only one author says that a city Edessa was renamed 'Aegeae': Justin 7.1.7, 'Caranus ... urbem Edessam ... Aegeas, populum Aegeadas vocavit'. He is talking of the legendary founder of the royal house, Caranus, capturing his first city and changing its name to 'Aegeae'; it is this origin which involves mention of a long-forgotten name from the distant past, 'Edessa'. It is erroneous to suppose that this Edessa of the dim past had anything to do with the famous fourth-century city Edessa, situated in its strategic position at Vodena. Neither Justin nor any other ancient author suggests that this was so."[2] Similarly Professor Georges Daux has written with regard to the difference between Aigeai and Edessa-Vodena, "L'unique responsable de cette erreur [qu'Aegeai est un autre nom d'Edessa] n'est autre que l'historien romain Justin ... "[3]

[1] Just. 7.1.7–12 (pp.70.24–71.15 Seel).
[2] *A History of Macedonia* I (Oxford 1972) 156.
[3] *CRAI* 1977, 621.

For the purpose of the present paper there is no need to rehearse the evidence showing that Aigeai is distinct from Edessa-Vodena;[4] nor do I wish here to discuss Hammond's proposal[5] to identify Aigeai with the site at Palatitsa—the excavations conducted by Professor Andronikos in the royal cemetery at Vergina nearby have brought strong support to the identification. My purpose is more limited: to explain that Justin (or rather Trogus) is not the only ancient author to have stated the earlier name of Aigeai to have been Edessa.

That Aigeai in Macedonia was formerly called Edessa is also stated in the scholia to the *Protreptikos* of Clement of Alexandria. In his comment upon the words αἶγες ἐπὶ μαντικὴν ἠσκημέναι (*Protr.* 2.11), Baanes the Notarios of Arethas, archbishop of Caesarea in Cappadocia, wrote:[6]

αἶγες] Καρανῷ τῷ Ποιάνθους υἱῷ ἐξ Ἄργους μέλλοντι ἀποι-
κίαν στέλλειν ἐπὶ Μακεδονίαν εἰς Δελφοὺς ἐλθόντι ἔχρησεν
ὁ Ἀπόλλων

    φράζεο, δῖε Καρανέ, νόῳ δ' ἐμὸν ἔνθεο μῦθον·
    ἐκπρολιπὼν Ἄργος τε καὶ Ἑλλάδα καλλιγύναικα
    χώρει πρὸς πηγὰς Ἁλιάκμονος· ἔνθα δ' ἂν αἶγας
    βοσκομένας ἐσίδῃς πρῶτον, τότε τοι χρεών ἐστιν
  5 ζηλωτὸν ναίειν αὐτὸν γενεάν τε πρόπασαν.

ἐκ δὴ τοῦ χρησμοῦ προθυμότερος γενόμενος <ὁ> Καρανός,
σύν τισιν Ἕλλησιν ἀποικίαν στειλάμενος, ἐλθὼν εἰς Μακε-
δονίαν ἔκτισεν πόλιν καὶ Μακεδόνων ἐβασίλευσεν καὶ τὴν
πρότερον καλουμένην Ἔδεσσαν πόλιν Αἰγὰς μετωνόμασεν
ἀπὸ τῶν αἰγῶν. ᾠκεῖτο δὲ τὸ παλαιὸν ἡ Ἔδεσσα ὑπὸ Φρυγῶν
καὶ Λυδῶν καὶ τῶν μετὰ Μίδου διακομισθέντων εἰς τὴν Εὐρώ-
πην. ταῦτα Εὐφορίων ἱστορεῖ ἐν †τῇ Ἱστίᾳ† καὶ τῷ Ἰνάχῳ.

4: τότε: τόθι Meineke
<ὁ> Wilamowitz   Αἰγὰς: αἶγας MSS.   Ἱστιαίαι Meineke,
Ἱστιαίαι ἢ Ἰνάχωι Bergk (the Histiaia they had in mind was the
Homeric commentator)

---

[4] Aigeai and Edessa-Vodena are still identified in *Kleine Pauly* 2 (1967) 197 *s.v.* "Edessa." But already *ad IG* IV 617.15 there is the note " ... Αἰγαί, quam urbem auctores quidam ab Edessa distinguunt (Fouc.)." The identification was also questioned by Ph. Papazoglou, *Makedonski Gradovi u Rimsko Doba* (Skopje 1957); I know of the book from M. Andronikos, "The Royal Tombs at Aigai (Vergina)," in M. B. Hatzopoulos and L. D. Loukopoulos, edd., *Philip of Macedon* (Athens 1980) 188 and 247 n.1, and from Daux (*supra* n.3) 622–23; see also G. Daux, *REG* 91 (1978) xix.

[5] Hammond (*supra* n.2) 157–58.

[6] Schol. Clem. Al. *Protr.* p.300.12–26 Stählin. Concerning Baanes' literary activity see Otto Stählin, ed., *Clemens Alexandrinus* I (Leipzig 1905) xviii–xix. The name Baanes is of Armenian origin (Vahan); compare Baanes the Paulician leader discussed by P. Lemerle, *Essais sur le monde byzantin* (London 1980) IV.69–70.

The passage quoted from Baanes appears as Euphorion fr.xxiv in A. Meineke, *Analecta Alexandrina* (Berlin 1843) 59–60; Euphorion fr.30 Scheidweiler (p.36); and Euphorion fr.32 in J. U. Powell, *Collectanea Alexandrina* (Oxford 1925) 36. Hammond discusses the verse oracle in the scholium but does not mention the connexion of the story with Euphorion; the omission is perhaps due to the fact that Parke and Wormell quote only the verses.[7]

Thus the story that Aigeai was formerly called Edessa can be taken back far earlier than Trogus-Justin—to Euphorion. The notion of a Phrygian invasion into Macedonia from Asia Minor may well be an invention of the early Hellenistic period; it is also found in Lyko-phron (*Alex.* 1397–1408). It is possible therefore that the tale of a change of name from Edessa to Aigeai is an invention of Euphorion. Such an innovation would be characteristic of him. Jacoby, however, suggested (*ad FGrHist* 115F393) that the common source for the Karanos tale in Trogus-Justin and Euphorion-Baanes was Theopom-pos. The suggestion is strengthened by the fact that Theopompos treated the story of the Phrygian Midas and Silenos (FF74, 75); that was set in the neighbourhood of Mount Bermion in Macedonia (Hdt. 8.138.3), and so not far from the streams of Haliakmon to which Karanos came according to the oracle in Euphorion-Baanes. It is necessary to emphasize, however, that there is no reason to ascribe to Theopompos the historically dubious notion of Phrygian immigra-tion from Asia to Macedonia such as is found in Euphorion and Lykophron. What Euphorion and Trogus took from Theopompos was the tale of Karanos settling at Aigeai, after the goats had led him there, in accordance with an oracle.

The folk-etymological connexion between goats and the name of Aigeai can be traced much earlier than Theopompos. Silver coins of the early fifth century conjecturally attributed to Aigeai show the goat (Head *HN*² 198f), and in Herodotos' delightful version of the Mace-donian foundation-legend Perdikkes, youngest of the three brothers and founder of the kingdom, is put in charge of τὰ λεπτὰ τῶν προ-βάτων (8.137.2 and 139). Euripides also made use of the story of the goats in his *Archelaos* (p.11 Austin). The versions of Euphorion-Baa-nes and Trogus-Justin share the goat-oracle also; it is a likely, if not quite certain, inference that it came to them by way of Theopompos.

Also shared by Euphorion and Justin is the statement that the former name of Aigeai was Edessa. The alleged toponym is best given as 'Old Edessa' to distinguish it from Edessa-Vodena; 'Old

[7] Hammond (*supra* n.2) 8–9; H. W. Parke and D. E. W. Wormell, *The Delphic Or-acle*² II (Oxford 1956) no. 225.

Edessa'-Aigeai lay near the lower Haliakmon, but Edessa-Vodena is to the northeast of Mount Bermion. When the immigrant Slavs in late antiquity called Vodena 'Watertown', they had in mind the river flowing by it.

It is a coincidence that in antiquity the toponym Edessa was also believed to mean 'Watertown': the incoming Slavs cannot have been aware of that recondite fact—they were simply using their eyes when they gave Vodena its name.[8] The witness for the ancient interpretation of 'Edessa' as 'Watertown' is Stephanos of Byzantion *s.v.* Ἔδεσσα: πόλις Συρίας. διὰ τὴν τῶν ὑδάτων ῥύμην οὕτω κληθεῖσα. ἀπὸ τῆς ἐν Μακεδονίᾳ (260.20f Meineke). Paul Kretschmer had the ancient interpretation in mind when, following Tomaschek, he made the—not quite certain—connexion of Ἔδεσσα with Phrygian Ϝέδυ 'water'.[9] The Phrygian link gains plausibility from the fact that Midas was associated in legend with the neighbourhood of Mount Bermion, but caution is needed: Neanthes of Kyzikos wrote that βέδυ, a word used by Macedonian priests, was said to mean ἀήρ (*FGrHist* 84F36). βέδυ, however, is explicitly stated to mean 'water',[10] and it is clear from Stephanos that Ἔδεσσα was thought to mean 'Watertown' or 'Rivertown'.

In Justin there is also a connexion of the name of 'Old Edessa' (Aigeai) with water. The goats lead Karanos through mist and a downpour: *urbem Edessam non sentientibus oppidanis propter imbrium et nebulae magnitudinem gregem caprarum imbrem fugientium secutus occupavit* (7.1.7). The goats and the deluge neatly combine in the oracular portent the old and the new names of the place. Thus Justin, following Trogus, linked the name of 'Old Edessa' with water. Baanes in his scholium to Clement shows that Euphorion mentioned 'Old Edessa'; the scholium gives no sign that he connected the name with water,[11] but he did link it with Phrygians.

If 'Old Edessa' were attested only by Justin, then it could perhaps be dismissed as a mythographic fiction; but we have traced it back as far as Euphorion, and there is a possiblity that it was mentioned even earlier than Euphorion, by Theopompos, as the previous name of Aigeai. Here we shall neither enquire why there were two places called

---

[8] See Daux (*supra* n.3) 622.

[9] P. Kretschmer, *Einleitung in die Geschichte der griechischen Sprache²* (Göttingen 1896) 286.

[10] Kern *Orph.Frag.* 219. βέδυ is also found in the alphabetical ritual formula recited by the Branchidai at Didyma and mentioned by Kallimachos fr.194.28–31 Pfeiffer. The formula begins βέδυ, ζάψ, χθώμ, πλῆκτρον, σφίγξ (Clem. Al. *Strom.* 5.8.48.5 [II 359.6 Stählin]).

[11] βέδυ is found next to ζάψ in the ritual formula of the Branchidai (*supra* n.10), and Euphorion used the word ζάψ (fr.3 Scheidweiler); but it does not follow that βέδυ also belonged to Euphorion's vocabulary.

Edessa in Macedonia nor ask whether there was a connexion between them.[12] Roman imperial copper coins of Edessa-Vodena dated to the times of Julia Domna, Caracalla, and Julia Paula show a goat on the reverses;[13] but there the animal appears as a traditional Macedonian symbol and no special link between Edessa-Vodena and Aigeai is being asserted.

Justin states that Perdikkas reigned after Karanos. At the end of his life Perdikkas gave instructions concerning his burial (7.2.2–4):

> *Siquidem senex moriens Argeo filio monstravit locum, quo condi vellet;*
> *ibique non sua tantum, sed et succedentium sibi in regnum ossa poni*
> *iussit, praefatus, quoad ibi conditae posterorum reliquiae forent, regnum*
> *in familia mansurum; creduntque hac superstitione extinctam in Alex-*
> *andro stirpem, quia locum sepulturae mutaverit.*

The *Epitoma* does not make clear exactly where the royal cemetery was to be, but there is nothing in the text to suggest that it was elsewhere than at 'Old Edessa'-Aigeai. The passage has a bearing upon the spectacular excavations of Professor Andronikos at Vergina and raises the hope that royal tombs of the Archaic period may yet be found there. But it is not only Justin who informs us that the early Macedonian kings reigned at the place formerly called Edessa: thanks to Baanes the Notary of the learned Arethas we learn that Euphorion had, long before Trogus, connected the position of 'Old Edessa' with the establishment of the Macedonian monarchy.[14]

THE QUEEN'S UNIVERSITY, BELFAST
April, 1983

---

[12] Note however Daux's hypothesis that "une partie de la population se serait dépla-cée au moment de la conquête de Caranos; l'Edessa que nous connaissons resulterait de cette migration, de ce transfert—voluntaire ou non—de population" (*supra* n.3: 625). The words quoted require slight modification in so far as Karanos is a secondary grafting on to the Macedonian royal line. In Herodotos (8.139) the founder of the kingdom is Perdikkes, and Thucydides (2.100.2) does not disagree with him. The late arrival of Karanos in the Macedonian royal pedigree is discussed by Hammond (*supra* n.2) 11–14. *Cf.* also R. Drews, *Basileus* (New Haven/London 1983) 67–69, on Theo-pompos F393. Ridgeway's identification of the name of Γαυάνης, one of the three brothers in Hdt. 8.137.1, with that of Karanos is extremely doubtful (*CQ* 20 [1926] 5).

[13] Head, *BMC Macedonia* (London 1879) 39f.

[14] Baanes also mentions Karanos at schol. Clem. Al. *Protr.* p.300.10f Stählin, immedi-ately before the Euphorion fragment: τερατοσκόπους] Καρανός τις Ἀργεῖος ἐπὶ ὀχήμα-τος αἰγῶν κατὰ χρησμὸν εἰς Μακεδονίαν μετῳκίσθη. But this looks more like an un-usual tale found by Baanes' source than a feature of the Karanos story according to Euphorion. Concerning the source Stählin wrote (I xxiii): "Baanes hat die von ihm ge-schriebenen Scholien der Vorlage entnommen. Ihr Verfasser war ein christlicher Gram-matiker etwa des 5. Jahrhunderts, dem es vor allem darauf ankam, seltene Ausdrücke zu glossieren oder zu Namen der Mythologie und Sage die betr. Geschichten zu erzählen."