

Homerica

G. L. Huxley

I

Homeric Syrie

Νῆσός τις Συρίη κικλήσκειται, εἴ που ἀκούεις
Ὀρτυγίης καθύπερθεν, ὅθι τροπαὶ ἠελίοιο.
(Homer, *Odyssey* 15.403-4)

“THERE IS AN ISLAND called Syrie” says Eumaeus to Odysseus, “— you perhaps have heard of it — above Ortygie, where are the turnings of the sun.” On the words “turnings of the sun” the scholiasts remark: “They say there is a cave of the sun there, through which they mark the turnings of the sun (QV). As it were towards the turnings of the sun, which is westwards, above Delos (BHQ). — So Aristarchus and Herodian (H).” Both explanations assume that Syrie is the island of Syros, and Ortygie Delos. Evidently there was supposed to be a sun cave at Syros in Hellenistic times; it was probably to the same marker that Diogenes Laertius [1.119] referred.

Syros cannot be Syrie, for the difference in length of the up-silons is an insuperable difficulty. Nor can Ortygie be Delos, the two places being distinct in the Homeric Hymn to Apollo: Leto is there said to have given birth to Apollo on Delos and to Artemis at Ortygie [16]. There were Ortygias at Syracuse and Ephesus, and there may well have been others at places where quails landed during their migrations.¹ Miss H. L. Lorimer suggested that Syrie was Syria,² but Homer was surprisingly ignorant if he took Syria to be an island, and the Phoenicians of the swineherd’s story would hardly have been thought to stay a whole year in a country so close to

¹G. S. Kirk and J. E. Raven, *The Presocratic Philosophers* (Cambridge 1957) 54 n. 2.

²H. L. Lorimer, *Homer and the Monuments* (London 1950) 80-84.

Phoenicia.³ Guided by the words of Eumaeus, we must look elsewhere for Syrie.

In the *Odyssey* [5.123] Orion is said to have been slain by Artemis at Ortygie, after he had been carried thither by Eos. The mention of Eos, the dawn, led Miss Lorimer to the view that Ortygie lay in the east.⁴ Eos was commonly thought to dwell in Aia, and since Aia was a part of the land of Colchis,⁵ Ortygie lay east of Greece, and probably in the Black Sea region.

By the words ὄθι τροπαὶ ἡελίοιο Homer cannot have meant anything so complicated as a place in which solstices were marked; it is impossible in Greek of any period for the expression to mean a cave for marking the turnings of the sun, as the scholia would have it. The natural meaning of the words ὄθι τροπαὶ ἡελίοιο is "in the direction of the solstice."

Solstices, as Kirk and Raven maintain, would normally be observed at sunrise,⁶ so that "where the summer solstice is" indicates the position in which the sun is observed to rise at midsummer; similarly "where the winter solstice is" points to the position at which it rises at midwinter. Records of the summer solstice are those most needed for calendary reckoning; therefore the simple expression ὄθι τροπαὶ ἡελίοιο would naturally call to mind the direction of the point on the horizon where the sun "turns" on the ecliptic at midsummer. Ortygie and Syrie thus lie north-east by east of Greece, since Odysseus and Eumaeus are talking in Ithaca. Here again the cryptic words of Homer point in the general direction of the Euxine.

The precise meaning of the first words of Eumaeus is not at once clear: they can mean either "there is an island called Syrie" or possibly "there is a kind of island that is called Syrian," if stress is laid on *τις*. The inhabitants of Levantine Syria and the Assyrians were not the only Syrians known to the Greeks, for the Pontic Syroi or Leukosyroi are well attested in early writers.⁷ They lived in the

³Kirk and Raven, *op.cit.* 54 n. 2.

⁴Lorimer, *op.cit.* 80ff.

⁵Schol. to A.R. 2.413 (p. 164 Wendel).

⁶*op.cit.* 54 n. 3.

⁷Hecat. *FGrHist* 1 F 200, 1 F 201; Hdt. 1.76. See Th. Nöldeke, *Hermes* 5 (1871) 443-468.

hinterland of Sinope in the country about Pteria, and once they had held the land in which the Milesian founders of Sinope settled.

There had also been a Phrygian settlement in the land of the Leukosyroi, for west of Sinope lay the little port of Armene.⁸ The name points to an Armenian settlement, and the Armenians were colonists of the Phrygians.⁹ The Halys flowed from a Mount Armenion to the sea east of Sinope.¹⁰ The natural harbors of Sinope gave to Phrygia an outlet to the Euxine in her most prosperous age before the Cimmerian invasions, at the time when Kyme was her outlet to the Aegean. Through Sinope Phrygia could trade with Urartu, and, through Kyme, with the west in the period of her thalassocracy in the late eighth century B.C.

The presence of Armeno-Phrygian settlers in the land of the Leukosyroi before the coming of the Greeks gave rise to the legend of a Thessalian foundation earlier than the Milesian;¹¹ the Thesalians were supposed to have come from Ormenion or Armenion, but the fiction is transparent.¹² The founders Autolykus, Deileon, and Phlogius, who came to war against the Amazons about Sinope from Ormenion in Thessaly, are taken over from the earlier Phrygian settlers. Both Phlogius and Autolykus later had oracles at Sinope; they are heroes of an indigenous cult, hellenized by the Milesians.¹³

The change from A to O, as in Armenos and Ormenos, Atreus, and Otreus, is typically Phrygian. The father of Eumaeus was Ktesios Ormenides. His name is rare, but the patronymic, son of Ormenus or Armenus, is found twice on the Trojan side in Homer,¹⁴ and points to a Phrygian or an Armenian. Eumaeus, then, came from a Phrygian princely line; that is why Homer calls the swineherd "a marshaller of men."¹⁵

All Homer's hints in the story of Eumaeus point to the Pontic

⁸Anon. *Per.Pont.Euxin.* 20 (C. Muller, *Geographi Graeci Minores*² 1 [Paris 1882] 407); Arrian, *Periplus* 14 (p. 84 ed. G. Marengi); St.Byz. *s.v.* 'Αρμένη; Str. 12.545.

⁹Hdt. 7.73.

¹⁰Hdt. 1.72.

¹¹Ps.Scymnus 946.

¹²P. Kretschmer, *Einleitung in die Geschichte der Griechischen Sprache* (Göttingen 1896) 210.

¹³*AJA* 9 (1905) 306 No. 31. F. Bilabel, *Die Ionische Kolonisation, Philologus Supplementband* 14.1 (Leipzig 1920) 33-34.

¹⁴*Il.* 8.274; 12.187.

¹⁵*Od.* 15.389.

coast of the Leukosyroi: the name Syrie itself, the name Ormenus, the natural meaning of the expression "where are the turnings of the sun," and the position of Ortygie all show that the poet had one place in mind; that place lay on the coast of the Leukosyrian land. There are no prominent islands on the coast, but the chief landmark to sailors voyaging eastwards along the southern shore of the Pontus is the Chersonese of Sinope. That is the island *νησός τις* which Homer names Syrie, the Syrian. In the twentieth century the Greeks of Sinope still called the promontory of Sinope *νησί*.¹⁶ Syrie lay *above* Ortygie, because the great cape must be rounded before a ship can sail on eastwards to Colchis, Aia, and the land of Eos.

Homer thinks of Syrie as an eighth century Greek would think of the place before the Milesians settled there. His knowledge comes from early Greek exploration of the Pontus, when the land of the Leukosyroi seemed so remote that the Phoenicians are made to spend a whole year there. The date of the passage depends upon the date of the Greek penetration of the Black Sea — a still uncertain matter.¹⁷

It is sometimes said that the foundation of Sinope by Miletus must have taken place as early as the middle of the eighth century B.C., because Trapezus was a colony of Sinope,¹⁸ and Eusebius dates the foundation of Trapezus in 756 B.C.¹⁹ The reasoning is not close; if the eighth century foundation of Trapezus is historical, the mother city may have been the Arcadian Trapezus,²⁰ the seat of

¹⁶D. M. Robinson, *Ancient Sinope* (Diss. Chicago, 1906) 131 n. 4.

¹⁷There is a sober discussion of the problem by A. J. Graham, "The Date of the Greek Penetration of the Black Sea," *Bulletin of the London Institute of Classical Studies* 5 (1958) 25-42.

¹⁸F. Miltner, "Die erste Milesische Kolonisation im Südpontus," *Anatolian Studies Buckler* (Manchester 1939) 191-195.

¹⁹Eus. II.80 (Schoene).

²⁰Pausanias (8.3.2) lists Arcadian Trapezus amongst the Arcadian places that founded cities. In 8.27.6 he states that the people of Pontic Trapezus welcomed settlers from Arcadian Trapezus as namesakes and brethren from the mother city at the time of the founding of Megale Polis. The name *Οἰζηνίς* in St. Byz. *s.v.* (Pontic) *Τραπεζοῦς* is possibly, as Meineke suggested, a corruption of the Arcadian name *Ἀξηνίς*. J. A. Cramer (*Asia Minor* 1 [Oxford 1832] 287) was, so far as I can find, the first to deny that Pontic Trapezus was founded by Arcadians; the words of Pausanias should not be rejected on account of the sameness of names. Arcadian Trapezus may well have been the mother city of a short-lived eighth century settlement, Sinope of a new foundation in the seventh century or later.

the Arcadian kings. The Peloponnesian interest in the Euxine would help to explain the mention of Colchis by Eumelus the Corinthian, who also made Sinope a daughter of Asopus,²¹ and who may have made her the mother of Syros by Apollo.²² The Peloponnesian settlement would not have lasted later than the Cimmerian attacks on Urartu and north eastern Asia Minor in the last quarter of the eighth century. The place may well have been refounded by Sinope in the seventh century B.C.

The Chersonese of Sinope was occupied by the Cimmerians, when they were fleeing from the Scythians;²³ the words of Herodotus here do not entail that there had been no previous Greek settlement at the place. Pseudo-Scymnus [947] noted a settlement led by Habrondas a Milesian, and he was thought to have been killed by the Cimmerians. The settlement evidently was short-lived and there is unlikely to be much archaeological material to prove its existence. The date is about 700 B.C., before the great Cimmerian and Trerian attack on western Asia Minor, which overthrew the might of Phrygia. After the Cimmerians, continues Pseudo-Scymnus, Cous and Cretines, exiles from Miletus, made a synoecism there [951]; that was when the Cimmerian host was overrunning Asia. The last words seem to refer to the raids on Ionia about 675 B.C., after the Cimmerians had moved westwards from their base at Sinope. The earliest finds of Greek material yet made at Sinope belong to the second half of the seventh century,²⁴ but when the place is better explored traces of the Milesian settlement about 675 B.C. should be found.

According to Nicolas of Damascus,²⁵ who followed Xanthus the historian of Lydia, the father of Gyges fled to the land of the Syroi who dwelt above Sinope, and married a Syrian woman. His words certainly imply a settlement at Sinope about 700 B.C., in the generation before Gyges, who reigned about 660 B.C. Whether the Sinope is the Phrygian settlement or the first Milesian is not stated, but at least the passage shows that there was a city about 700 B.C.

²¹Frg. 8 Kinkel *ap.* Schol. to A.R. 2.946 (p. 197 Wendel); *cf.* C. M. Bowra, *Hermes* 73 (1938) 213-221.

²²D.S. 4.72.2; Plu. *Luc.* 23.

²³Hdt. 4.12.

²⁴Graham, *op.cit.* (*supra* n. 17) discusses the excavations of Akurgal and Budde at Sinope.

²⁵*FGrHist* 90 F 46.

in the land of the Syrians called Sinope. The same fact is implied by the fragment of Eumelus that names Sinope.

Eumaeus says that his homeland was not too full of people, but abounding in flocks and wine and wheat. Such a description well fits the rich land about Sinope, whose natural advantages are carefully described by Strabo.²⁶ Homer does not name the two cities over which Ktesios held sway, but we can guess. One was the Phrygian settlement of Sinope; the other was Pteria, the Greek name of Hattusas, which once had been the capital of the Hittite Empire. Possibly Syroi and Leukosyroi were the Greeks' names for the survivors of the Hittites who still lived in the country between Pteria and Sinope in the eighth century B.C.

Eumaeus makes his story sound like a prospectus for a colony;²⁷ such stories as his of lands awaiting settlement in the west and on the shores of the Pontus encouraged the Greeks of the eighth century to sail further afield, first to explore and later to colonize. There is no suggestion in the *Odyssey* that Odysseus went to the Pontus, and even the allusions to the Argonautica are not expressly to the Pontic Argonautica. After the work of Eumelus, however, the Argonautica was firmly connected with the Pontus, and Colchis, which Homer does not mention, entered the Corinthian and Milesian epics. If there is any truth in the Eusebian date for Trapezus, then the *Odyssey's* only mention of a place on the coast of the Euxine, Syrie with Ortygie, should be dated nearer 750 B.C. than 700 B.C. The remote Homeric view of the Pontus is in any case earlier than the work of Eumelus, who lived before the first Messenian war, that is before the thirties of the eighth century B.C. By the time of the brief founding of Sinope by Habrondas, the Euxine was well known to explorers from Ionia and from mainland Greece, who had no difficulty in sailing there and needed only the motive to do so. The motive was given by the hope of trade with Urartu in the great awakening before the Cimmerian and Trierian invasions. By 700 B.C. the Euxine (I suggest) was well known to the Greeks, but in 750 B.C. the northeastern sea was still strange and remote. It is strange and remote in the *Odyssey*; Odysseus is sup-

²⁶Str. 12.545.

²⁷Lorimer, *op.cit.* (*supra* n. 2) 80ff.

posed to have heard of Syrie, but not to have been there. The Syrie of Eumaeus is the land of the Leukosyroi as it was known to an Ionian poet about the third quarter of the eighth century B.C.

June 1959

II

Eugamon

OUR KNOWLEDGE OF EUGAMON'S EPIC POEM the *Telegony* comes from a summary in the *Chrestomathy* of Proclus. Not one hexameter is quoted from his work by an ancient author: Eugamon is a poet without poetry, but I shall show that he is a rewarding subject for literary investigation.

Then there is the *Odyssey* of Homer, wrote Proclus;¹ next two books of the *Telegony* of Eugammon,² a Cyrenean, comprising the following:

The suitors are buried by their kinsfolk.

And Odysseus, after sacrificing to the nymphs, sails away to inspect the herds,³ and is entertained by Polyxenus, and receives a crater as a gift. After that came the story of Trophonius and Agamedes and Augeas. [Since Polyxenus was king of Elis, this part of the poem was certainly set in Peloponnese.]

Then he sails back to Ithaca and offers the sacrifices prescribed by Tiresias. And afterwards he goes to the Thesprotians, and marries Callidice, queen of the Thesprotians. Then the Thesprotians make war on the Brygians under the leadership of Odysseus. Thereupon Ares puts to flight the companions of Odysseus, and Athena engages Ares in battle; but Apollo reconciles them. And after the death of Callidice, Polypoetes son of Odysseus succeeds to the kingdom, and Odysseus goes to Ithaca.

Meanwhile Telegonus, sailing to look for his father, lands in Ithaca and lays the island waste. After marching out to repel him, Odysseus is killed by his son in ignorance. After seeing his mistake Telegonus took the body of his father, with Telemachus and Penelope, to his mother; she made them immortal. And Telegonus married Penelope and Telemachus Circe.

¹E. Bethe, *Homer* II (Berlin 1922) 186.

²The spelling Εὐγάμων was defended by O. Crusius, *Philologus* 54 (1895) 733 with n. 51. Proclus has Εὐγάμμων, Eusebius Εὐγάμων. Crusius thought the name meant 'Hochzeitfreund,' and his spelling is followed by Schmid-Stählin, *Geschichte der Griechischen Literatur* I.i (Munich 1929) 217 n. 4. Cf. A. Hartmann, *Untersuchungen über die Sagen vom Tod des Odysseus* (Munich 1917) 47.

³Cf. Noemon's herds in Elis: *Od.* 4.630.

Eustathius, commenting on *Odyssey* 16.118, noted: "The Cyrenean who wrote the *Telegony* calls the son of Odysseus by Calypso Telegonus or Teledamus, and his sons by Penelope Telemachus and Arcesilaus." Τηλέδαμον will not scan in an hexameter, and Wilamowitz⁴ suggested Τηλέδαπον. In other authorities Telegonus is a son of Circe; Eustathius or his source probably made a slip here. Arcesilaus is plainly due to Eugamon, who wished to connect the royal house of Cyrene with his hero Odysseus.

Other Cyrenean elements can be detected in the plot of the *Telegony*. In a digression Eugamon told the story of the treasury of Augeas and how Trophonius built it. In the *Telegony* the tale may have been depicted upon the crater given by Polyxenus to Odysseus.⁵ It is told in enough detail in a fragment of Charax of Pergamum⁶ to show that the point of the plot was the same as in the Herodotean tale of the robbing of the treasury of Rhampsinitus: the Egyptian who left the loose stone in the treasury becomes Trophonius in the *Telegony*. The change is typical of the mixed culture of Cyrene, part Hellenic, part Libyan, and influenced by Egypt. Since the *floruit* of Eugamon is given by Eusebius as Olympiad 53.3 (566 B.C.), the poet probably was active under king Arcesilaus II, and the Arcesilaus of the *Telegony* was perhaps named after him; possibly Eugamon was his court poet.

Clement of Alexandria remarked that early Greek epic poets were notorious for their thefts. He cited as an example of plagiarism Eugamon's passing off the whole book of Musaeus on the Thesprotians as his own.⁷ It is true that part of the *Telegony* is set in Thesprotia, but that does not prove Eugamon to have stolen from Musaeus or anyone else. Rhapsodes had no sense of copyright and were at liberty to borrow each others' stories. Clement or his source probably saw that the *Thesprotis* and part of the *Telegony* had a great deal in common; but it cannot be proved that Eugamon took over the entire *Thesprotis* into his *Telegony*.

The *Telegony* has recently been studied with great penetration

⁴*Homerische Untersuchungen* (Berlin 1884) 183.

⁵RE 21.2 (1952) 1854.

⁶FGrHist 103 F 5. Cf.Hdt. 2.121; Wilamowitz, *op.cit.* 186; D. B. Munro, *JHS* 5 (1884) 41; E. Schwartz, *Die Odyssee* (Munich 1924) 149 n. 1.

⁷Clem. Al. Strom. 6.2.25.1. Homer 5 (*ed.* T. W. Allen) 143.

by Merkelbach.⁸ He has compared the prophecy of Tiresias made in the *Nekyomanteia*⁹ with events in the *Telegony*. As may be expected in a poem designed to continue the *Odyssey*, the plot of the *Telegony* accords well with the prophecy of the Theban seer. "After you kill the suitors in your halls," says he, "either by stealth or with the sharp bronze, then next set out taking a well-smoothed oar, until you come to the people who know not the sea and eat no food mixed with salt . . . I shall tell you a very obvious sign which shall not escape you: when another traveller meets you and says that you have a winnowing fan on your sturdy shoulder, then fix the oar in the ground and make good sacrifice to lord Poseidon, a ram, a bull, and a breeding boar. Then go back home and sacrifice holy hecatombs to the immortal gods, who dwell in the broad heaven: to each of them in turn. And a painless death shall come to you from the sea" [or possibly "far from the sea" — the word was taken both ways in antiquity] "that shall take you off in gentle old age. The people around you shall be prosperous; it is the unerring truth that I tell." In the *Telegony* Odysseus sets out on his wanderings again and he is killed by Telegonus, who comes from the sea. In the Apollodorean *Epitome*¹⁰ details missing in Proclus are given: Telegonus coming to Ithaca drove away some of the cattle; and when Odysseus defended them, Telegonus wounded him with a spear barbed with the spine of a sting ray. Odysseus then died of the wound. Here the sting ray is the death that came from the sea — an ingenious device to explain the words of Tiresias. We cannot know whether it was an invention of Eugamon himself; Sophocles, who may have drawn on Eugamon, told the story in his *Odysseus Acanthoplex*.¹¹

Merkelbach considered that the order to Odysseus to go inland was fulfilled in the *Telegony* in Epirus. Tradition, it is true, placed at Bouneima the inland people visited by Odysseus with the oar, or sent him to Trampya amongst the Eurytanes of the Pindus range.¹² Odysseus was thus made to go as far inland as possible

⁸R. Merkelbach, *Untersuchungen zur Odyssee*, Zetemata 2 (Munich 1951) 142-155.

⁹*Od.* 11.119-137.

¹⁰107.36 (p. 302 *ed.* J. G. Frazer).

¹¹A. C. Pearson, *The Fragments of Sophocles* 2 (Cambridge 1917) 105-114.

¹²Steph. Byz. *s.v.* Βούνειμα. Schol. Lyc. *Alex.* 800. Wilamowitz, *op.cit.* 189 n. 30.

in northern Greece to obey the orders of Tiresias. However, in the summary of Proclus, Odysseus carries out in *Ithaca* the sacrifices bidden by Tiresias. Merkelbach¹³ therefore emended the text of Proclus: instead of ἔπειτα εἰς Ἴθάκην καταπλεύσας τὰς ὑπὸ Τειρεσίου ῥηθείσας τελεῖ θυσίας, he proposed to read ἔπειτα εἰς Ἥπειρον. The change is ingenious, but the rough handling of the evidence unnecessary. In his prophecy Tiresias orders Odysseus to go to the people who eat no salt with their food, and to sacrifice to Poseidon there; then he is to return home and to sacrifice to all the immortal gods in turn. The words of Proclus τὰς ὑπὸ Τειρεσίου ῥηθείσας τελεῖ θυσίας therefore apply to the group of sacrifices to be performed in Ithaca on the return of Odysseus from the land of the saltless people.

It follows that in the *Telegony* the sacrifices to Poseidon were made before Odysseus returned from Polyxenus in Elis to Ithaca. Proclus does not mention them, but it can be shown that in the *Telegony* Odysseus did indeed sacrifice far from the sea before he left Elis for Ithaca. The Arcadians were well known for their ignorance of maritime matters: accordingly Eugamon was able to send Odysseus to sacrifice to Poseidon in Arcadia. To confirm that he did so, the coins of Mantinea include types depicting Odysseus bearing an oar on his shoulder;¹⁴ there, then, in central Peloponnese, according to one interpretation of the prophecy of Tiresias, Odysseus sacrificed to Poseidon far from the sea. To conclude the reasoning thus far: Odysseus sacrificed to Poseidon far inland before he returned to make other sacrifices in Ithaca. Before he came back to Ithaca in the *Telegony*, he was in Peloponnese, and the representation of Odysseus with an oar on the coins of Mantinea shows that in the *Telegony* the hero went to Arcadia to sacrifice to Poseidon far inland. Then he went back to Ithaca, after seeing Polyxenus in Elis, and sacrificed to all the immortals. Proclus mentioned only the sacrifices in Ithaca.

The story of Trophonius and the treasury in the *Telegony* is only a digression, but it deserves passing notice. When Eugamon described the gift of Polyxenus to Odysseus, he may have had in mind a

¹³*Op.cit.* (*supra* n. 8) 147.

¹⁴J. Svoronos, "Ulysse chez les Arcadiens et la Télégonie d'Eugammon," *Gazette archéologique* 13 (1888) 269. B. V. Head, *Historia Numorum*² (Oxford 1911) 450.

Laconian crater, for the pottery of Sparta was very popular at Cyrene and the Arcesilaus vase, made in the lifetime of Eugamon, shows that the Laconian potters and painters were interested in Cyrenean subjects. Amongst the Laconian material found in Samos is a fragment showing a man holding what appears to be the capstone of a building. Bochlau¹⁵ reasonably identified the man as Trophonius erecting a tholos and his interpretation was accepted by Lane.¹⁶ Certainly the circle held by the man is too large for a discus — even Heracles would have difficulty in throwing that. Eugamon, we may suggest, described a vase with the story of Trophonius drawn upon it and so prompted some Laconian painter to make a real vase showing the architect and his tholos.

We come now to the link between the *Odyssey* and the *Telegony*. Eugamon based the plot of his poem on the prophecy of Tiresias; but when he fitted the *Telegony* to the already existing *Odyssey*, had the twenty fourth book, which many competent critics, ancient and modern, consider later than the rest of the poem, already been added? Or did the version of the *Odyssey* to which Eugamon adapted his epic, end at about 23.296? That is where Aristophanes and Aristarchus set the true end of the *Odyssey*.¹⁷ The arguments tending to prove that Book 24, the *Continuation*, is later than the rest of the *Odyssey*, and that its author flagrantly abused the language of traditional epic, have been stated with clarity and vigour by D. L. Page¹⁸ and do not need to be rehearsed here. It would be valuable to know whether the rhapsodic *Continuation* was already part of the *Odyssey* known to Eugamon in the sixth century B.C.: I propose that the Cyrenean used an *Odyssey* lacking the *Continuation*.

It has been suggested that the *Continuation* from 23.396 onwards was designed to link the *Odyssey* to the beginning of Eugamon's poem.¹⁹ There is, however, a difficulty in that solution: for the first statement made by Proclus about the *Telegony* is that the

¹⁵J. Bochlau, *Aus ionischen und italischen Nekropolen* (Leipzig 1899) 128 and Pl. 10.4.

¹⁶E. A. Lane, "Laconian Vase Painting," *ABSA* 34 [1933-34] (1936) 165-166:

"Trophonius erecting a Tholos."

¹⁷D. L. Page, *The Homeric Odyssey* (Oxford 1955) 101.

¹⁸*Ibid.* 101-111.

¹⁹Schwartz, *op.cit.* 148ff. Page, *op.cit.* 129 with n. 33.

suitors are buried by their kinsfolk. If the *Continuation* were a link between the two poems, then the suitors would have been buried twice — once in the *Continuation* and once at the beginning of the *Telegony*. For in fact the suitors are buried in the *Continuation* (24.417):

ἐκ δὲ νέκυσ οἴκων φόρεον καὶ θάπτου ἕκαστοι.

Therefore the *Continuation* overlaps the beginning of the *Telegony*, and the conclusion follows that the *Continuation* is not a link between the *Odyssey* and the *Telegony*. It is most probable therefore that Eugamon took up the story at about 23.296. Indeed the *Telegony* does begin where the *Odyssey* proper ends: the suitors, who by 23.296 are still unburied, are interred by their kinsfolk at the very beginning of Eugamon's poem. It seems then that there were texts of the *Odyssey* current in the mid-sixth century which lacked the *Continuation* and that Eugamon used one of them; the great Alexandrian critics may well have had diplomatic support for their rejection from the canon of Homer all that followed 23.296, and the reader who senses that the inept rhapsodising of Book 24 is unworthy of Homer's *Odyssey* can only applaud their judgement.

Eugamon, in short, is interesting for a number of reasons: he linked Mantinea with the journey of Odysseus to appease Poseidon; to please the Cyrenean royalty he made Arcesilaus a son of Odysseus; and he almost certainly began his *Telegony* at the place where Aristophanes and Aristarchus thought the true end of the *Odyssey* to be. An obscure figure he will always be; but because the plot of the *Telegony* bears upon the state of the *Odyssey* in the sixth century B.C., there is reason enough to study that Cyrenean poet.

December 1959

III

A Poem of the Homeridae

IN THE PHAEDRUS (252 B) Plato stated that the Homeridae recited from their private poems two lines to Eros. The second he thought outrageous and not quite metrical.

λέγουσι δὲ οἱμαί τινες Ὀμηριδῶν ἐκ τῶν ἀποθέτων ἐπῶν
 δύο ἔπη εἰς τὸν Ἔρωτα, ᾧν τὸ ἕτερον ὑβριστικὸν πάνν
 καὶ οὐ σφόδρα τι ἔμμετρον· ὑμνοῦσι δὲ ᾧδε —

τὸν δ' ἦτοι θνητοὶ μὲν Ἔρωτα καλοῦσι ποτηγόν
 ἀθάνατοι δὲ Πτέρωτα, διὰ πτεροφύτορ' ἀνάγκην.

[*Phdr.* 252 B 4–9, *ed.* Burnet]

οἱμαί T: οἱ μὲν B. ὑβριστικὸν πάνν B: πάνν ὑβριστικὸν
 T Stobaeus. δ' ἦτοι T: δῆ τοι B Stobaeus. πτεροφύτορ'
 Stobaeus, πτερόφυτον B: πτερόφουτον T.

Wilamowitz held that Plato was joking,¹ Wade-Gery that he was parodying.² The second line is surprising, for the correction is without parallel: Plato at once noticed the metrical irregularity. Allen³ simply wrote “the correction of δε πτ- is intended,” but that was to dismiss the anomaly without explaining it. To any Athenian ear the line would have sounded wrong, and not just odd.

For δέ to be short, πτ- must be pronounced as a single consonant. The dialect of Greek in which that is possible is Aeolic. In Thessaly πτ could become ττ, as in *πολιάρχου*,⁴ and *ἀρχιπολιάρχεντος*.⁵ It is not clear whether ττ was pronounced as a diphthong or not, but Thessalian also shows a development from πτ to ττ and thence to τ. The single τ can be seen in *Τολεμαῖος*,⁶ which derives from *Πτολεμαῖος*. Here the initial would not be pronounced as a diphthong. Similarly the word *Πτέρωτα* could be written in Aeolic *Τέρωτα*, and pronounced so as not to make position. δέ thus could remain short for an Aeolic speaker, but to Plato's ear there naturally seemed to be an irregularity.

¹*Die Ilias und Homer* (Berlin 1916) 366 n. 4.

²*The Poet of the Iliad* (Cambridge 1952) 71 n. 50.

³*Homer: The Origins and the Transmission* (Oxford 1924) 44.

⁴C. D. Buck, *The Greek Dialects*³ (Chicago 1955) 61 para. 67.

⁵Buck, *op.cit.* 73 para. 86.2

⁶O. Hoffmann, *Die Griechischen Dialekte* (Göttingen 1893) 2.507; 518.

The unique *πτεροφύτορ'* can be retained, for the word is a compound of *φύω*; the *υ* of *φνω* can be scanned long or short, being generally short before a vowel and long before a consonant. The unmetrical *πτερόφυτον* is probably a corruption of *πτεροφύτορ'*, and the origin of *πτερόφοιτον*. If the *πτ-* of *πτεροφύτορ'* was subject to the same treatment as in *πτέρωτα*, then *διὰ* must be scanned *διὰ* with long *alpha*. The scansion *διὰ*, with *alpha* long, is common in Homer.

The private verses quoted by Plato were therefore originally recited by the Homeridae in Aeolic. In Chios where the Homeridae lived there was a strong Aeolic element in the population. Bolissos in the north of the island is even called an Aeolian city by Stephen of Byzantium;⁷ the notice comes from Ephorus, who connected Homer with Bolissos.⁸ The Homeridae may have lived there, for the Aeolism of their private verses quoted by Plato suggests that they were influenced by the Aeolic speech of the island. Plato, then, was not joking, nor was he parodying; in the *Phaedrus* he gave a version of an Aeolic couplet from the *apotheta* of the Homeridae of Chios.

ALL SOULS COLLEGE, OXFORD

November 1959

⁷*s.v.* Βολισσός.

⁸*FGrHist* 70 F 103. [Ps.Hdt.] *Vit.Hom.* 21-24.